# Web Appendix for <br> "Formulating, Identifying and Estimating the <br> Technology of Cognitive and Noncognitive Skill Formation" 

Flavio Cunha<br>James Heckman<br>University of Pennsylvania The University of Chicago,<br>American Bar Foundation<br>and University College Dublin

This draft, July 30, 2008

## I Identification when $\eta_{t}^{N}$ is serially correlated

In the discussion of identification in the text, we assumed that $\eta_{t}^{N}$ is independently distributed over time. Consider the case in which $\eta_{t}^{N}$ follows an $\operatorname{AR}(1)$ process:

$$
\eta_{t+1}^{N}=\rho^{N} \eta_{t}^{N}+v_{t+1}^{N},
$$

where $v_{t+1}^{N}$ has mean zero. Using the law of motion (16) from the paper, generalized to allow for time-varying coefficients, the difference $\theta_{t+1}^{N}-\rho^{N} \theta_{t}^{N}$ satisfies:

$$
\begin{align*}
\theta_{t+1}^{N}-\rho \theta_{t}^{N}= & \gamma_{0, t+1}^{N}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{0, t}^{N}+\gamma_{1, t}^{N} \theta_{t}^{N}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{1, t-1}^{N} \theta_{t-1}^{N}+\gamma_{2, t}^{N} \theta_{t}^{C}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{2, t-1}^{N} \theta_{t-1}^{C}+\gamma_{3, t}^{N} I_{t} \\
& -\rho^{N} \gamma_{3, t-1}^{N} I_{t-1}+v_{t+1}^{N} \tag{I.1}
\end{align*}
$$

or

$$
\begin{align*}
\theta_{t+1}^{N}= & \gamma_{0, t+1}^{N}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{0, t}^{N}+\left(\rho^{N}+\gamma_{1, t}^{N}\right) \theta_{t}^{N}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{1, t-1}^{N} \theta_{t-1}^{N}+\gamma_{2, t}^{N} \theta_{t}^{C}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{2, t-1}^{N} \theta_{t-1}^{C}+\gamma_{3, t}^{N} I_{t} \\
& -\rho^{N} \gamma_{3, t-1}^{N} I_{t-1}+v_{t+1}^{N} . \tag{I.2}
\end{align*}
$$

By the same logic

$$
\begin{align*}
\theta_{t}^{N}= & \gamma_{0, t}^{N}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{0, t-1}^{N}+\left(\rho^{N}+\gamma_{1, t-1}^{N}\right) \theta_{t-1}^{N}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{1, t-2}^{N} \theta_{t-2}^{N}+\gamma_{2, t-1}^{N} \theta_{t-1}^{C}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{2, t-2}^{N} \theta_{t-2}^{C} \\
& +\gamma_{3, t-1}^{N} I_{t}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{3, t-2}^{N} I_{t-2}+v_{t}^{N} . \tag{I.3}
\end{align*}
$$

Again, we use the measurement equations

$$
Y_{1, t}^{N}, Y_{1, t-1}^{N}, Y_{1, t-1}^{C}, Y_{1, t-1}^{I},
$$

instead of

$$
\theta_{t}^{N}, \theta_{t-1}^{N}, \theta_{t-1}^{C}, \theta_{t-1}^{I}
$$

As before, OLS regressions will produce inconsistent estimates, but we can use

$$
\left(Y_{j, t-1}^{N}\right)_{j=2}^{m_{t}^{N}},\left(Y_{j, t-1}^{C}\right)_{j=2}^{m_{t}^{C}} \text { and }\left(Y_{j, t-1}^{I}\right)_{k=2}^{m_{t}^{I}}
$$

as instruments for

$$
Y_{1, t-1}^{N}, Y_{1, t-1}^{C}, \text { or } Y_{t-1}^{I}
$$

in (I.3). As a result, we can identify the parameters

$$
\begin{aligned}
&\left(\gamma_{0, t+1}^{N}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{0, t}^{N}\right),\left(\rho^{N}+\gamma_{1, t-1}^{N}\right),\left(\rho^{N} \gamma_{1, t-2}^{N}\right),\left(\gamma_{2, t-1}^{N}\right),\left(\rho^{N} \gamma_{2, t-2}^{N}\right),\left(\gamma_{3, t-1}^{N}\right), \\
&\left(\rho^{N} \gamma_{3, t-2}^{N}\right),\left(\gamma_{4, t-1}^{N}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{4, t-2}^{N}\right), \quad \text { and }\left(\gamma_{5, t-1}^{N}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{5, t-2}^{N}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

If we apply our strategy to this setting and plug

$$
Y_{1, t+1}^{N}, Y_{1, t}^{N}, Y_{1, t}^{C}, \text { and } Y_{1, t}^{I} \text { instead of } \theta_{t+1}^{N}, \theta_{t}^{N}, \theta_{t}^{C}, \text { and } \theta_{t}^{I}
$$

into (I.2) and use

$$
\left(Y_{j, t}^{N}\right)_{j=2}^{m_{t}^{N}},\left(Y_{j, t}^{C}\right)_{j=2}^{m_{t}^{C}}, \text { and }\left(Y_{j, t}^{I}\right)_{k=2}^{m_{t}^{I}}
$$

as instruments, we can obtain the parameters

$$
\left(\gamma_{0, t+1}^{N}-\rho^{N} \gamma_{0, t}^{N}\right),\left(\rho^{N}+\gamma_{1, t}^{N}\right),\left(\rho^{N} \gamma_{1, t-1}^{N}\right),\left(\gamma_{2, t}^{N}\right),\left(\rho^{N} \gamma_{2, t-1}^{N}\right) \text { and }\left(\gamma_{3, t}^{N}\right),\left(\rho^{N} \gamma_{3, t-1}^{N}\right) .
$$

We can recover $\rho^{N}$ from two sources. First, from the estimation in (I.3) we identify $\gamma_{2, t-1}^{N}$, while in (I.2) we identify $\rho^{N} \gamma_{2, t-1}^{N}$. From the ratio of these two parameters we get $\rho^{N}$. Second, we can use the ratio of $\rho^{N} \gamma_{3, t-1}^{N}$ (which we obtain in our regression in (I.2)) to $\gamma_{3, t-1}^{N}$ (which we obtain from (I.3)). Once we identify $\rho^{N}$, we can recover the other parameters of interest. We can do a parallel analysis for the cognitive equation. This discussion assumes access to the relevant initial conditions of the process.

| Web Appendix Table 1 Correlation - White Children NLSY/1979-6 years old |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Math | Reading | Composition | Antisocial | Anxious | Headstrong | Hyperactive | Conflict |
| Piat Math ${ }^{1}$ | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Reading Recognition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.4794 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Composition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.4462 | 0.9196 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Antisocial Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1298 | 0.0987 | 0.0662 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |
| Anxious Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1031 | 0.0834 | 0.0505 | 0.3952 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |
| Headstrong Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1255 | 0.0915 | 0.0619 | 0.5159 | 0.5587 | 1.0000 |  |  |
| Hyperactive Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1642 | 0.1645 | 0.1352 | 0.4989 | 0.4551 | 0.6019 | 1.0000 |  |
| Conflict Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.0694 | 0.0617 | 0.0545 | 0.4877 | 0.4035 | 0.4196 | 0.3519 | 1.0000 |
| Log Current Family Income ${ }^{2}$ | 0.1665 | 0.1672 | 0.1427 | 0.0824 | 0.1038 | 0.1153 | 0.0734 | 0.1111 |
| Number of Books ${ }^{3}$ | 0.1696 | 0.2257 | 0.2346 | 0.0299 | 0.0993 | 0.1437 | 0.1788 | 0.0831 |
| Musical Instrument ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1673 | 0.1600 | 0.1401 | 0.1086 | 0.1325 | 0.0906 | 0.1445 | 0.1379 |
| Newspaper ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1248 | 0.1896 | 0.1786 | 0.1373 | 0.0609 | 0.0804 | 0.1163 | 0.1028 |
| Child has special lessons ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1407 | 0.1739 | 0.1406 | 0.1922 | 0.2061 | 0.1518 | 0.1981 | 0.1354 |
| Child goes to museums ${ }^{5}$ | 0.1158 | 0.0525 | 0.0106 | 0.1003 | 0.0732 | 0.0093 | 0.1329 | 0.0372 |
| Child goes to theater ${ }^{5}$ | 0.1470 | 0.1079 | 0.0860 | 0.0670 | 0.0740 | 0.0533 | 0.1035 | 0.0452 |
| Education of the mother | 0.2077 | 0.1880 | 0.2105 | 0.1436 | 0.1504 | 0.1002 | 0.2038 | 0.1482 |
| Child ever sees father ${ }^{4}$ | 0.0233 | 0.0626 | 0.0392 | 0.0010 | 0.0726 | 0.0798 | 0.0542 | 0.0234 |
| Child spends time with father indoors ${ }^{6}$ | 0.2009 | 0.1919 | 0.1773 | 0.1781 | 0.1397 | 0.1138 | 0.1795 | 0.1260 |
| Child spends time with father outdoors ${ }^{6}$ | 0.1275 | 0.0688 | 0.0779 | 0.2090 | 0.1030 | 0.1580 | 0.1936 | 0.1346 |
| Child eats with father and mother ${ }^{6}$ | 0.0981 | 0.0722 | 0.0620 | 0.1119 | 0.1085 | 0.0528 | 0.0292 | 0.0878 |
| Child sees relatives and family friends ${ }^{6}$ | 0.1091 | 0.0880 | 0.0560 | -0.0031 | 0.0731 | -0.0042 | 0.0424 | 0.0200 |
| Mother's ASVAB (AR) ${ }^{7}$ | 0.2434 | 0.2143 | 0.2060 | 0.1019 | 0.1013 | 0.1142 | 0.1506 | 0.0430 |
| Mother's ASVAB (WK) ${ }^{8}$ | 0.1947 | 0.2553 | 0.2743 | 0.1197 | 0.1492 | 0.0772 | 0.1686 | 0.1100 |
| Mother's ASVAB (PC) ${ }^{9}$ | 0.1695 | 0.2011 | 0.2044 | 0.1217 | 0.1541 | 0.0967 | 0.1911 | 0.0993 |
| Mother's ASVAB (NO) ${ }^{10}$ | 0.2273 | 0.1965 | 0.1933 | 0.1635 | 0.1395 | 0.1494 | 0.2005 | 0.1956 |
| Mother's ASVAB (CS) ${ }^{11}$ | 0.2079 | 0.2321 | 0.2209 | 0.1882 | 0.1711 | 0.1523 | 0.1858 | 0.1887 |
| Mother's ASVAB (MK) ${ }^{12}$ | 0.2419 | 0.2259 | 0.2158 | 0.1152 | 0.1261 | 0.1368 | 0.1635 | 0.0718 |

${ }^{1}$ The variables are standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire CNLSY/79 sample.
${ }^{2}$ Family Income is inflation adjusted. Base year is 2000 .
${ }^{3}$ The variable takes the value 1 if the child has no books, 2 if the child has 1 or 2 books, 3 if the child has 3 to 9 books and 4 if the child has 10 or more books.
${ }^{4}$ For example, for musical instrument, the variable takes value 1 if the child has a musical instrument at home and 0 otherwise. Other variables are defined accordingly.
${ }^{5}$ For example, for "museums", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never went to the museum in the last calendar year, 1 if the child went to the museum once or twice in the last calendar year, 3 if the child went to the museum several times in the past calendar year, 4 if the child went to the museum about once a month in the last calendar year, and 5 if the child went to a museum once a week in the last calendar year.
${ }^{6}$ For example, for "Child spends time with father indoors", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never spends time with the father indoors, 2 if the child spends time with the father indoors a few times in a year, 3 if the child spend time with the father indoors about once a month, 4 if the child spends time with the father indoors about once a week, 5 if the child spends time with the father indoors at least four times a week, and 6 if the child spends time with the father once a day or more often.
${ }^{7}$ AR stands for Arithmetic Reasoning. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{8}$ WK stands for Word Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{9} \mathrm{PC}$ stands for Paragraph Composition. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{10} \mathrm{NO}$ stands for Numerical Operations. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{11}$ CS stands for Coding Speed. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{12}$ MK stands for Mathematics Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample

|  | Web Appendix Table 2 Correlation - White Children NLSY/1979-7 years old |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Math | Reading | Composition | Antisocial | Anxious | Headstrong | Hyperactive | Conflict |
| Piat Math ${ }^{1}$ | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Reading Recognition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5945 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Composition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5559 | 0.8520 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Antisocial Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.0950 | 0.1225 | 0.1201 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |
| Anxious Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.0742 | 0.1246 | 0.1179 | 0.4395 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |
| Headstrong Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.0533 | 0.1196 | 0.0926 | 0.5983 | 0.5173 | 1.0000 |  |  |
| Hyperactive Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.2473 | 0.2585 | 0.1917 | 0.5035 | 0.4699 | 0.5505 | 1.0000 |  |
| Conflict Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.0488 | 0.0801 | 0.0749 | 0.4680 | 0.4380 | 0.4157 | 0.3549 | 1.0000 |
| Log Current Family Income ${ }^{2}$ | 0.1387 | 0.1238 | 0.0920 | 0.0688 | 0.1693 | 0.0984 | 0.1427 | 0.0946 |
| Number of Books ${ }^{3}$ | 0.1655 | 0.0858 | 0.0669 | 0.1000 | 0.0432 | 0.0954 | 0.1113 | 0.0799 |
| Musical Instrument ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1371 | 0.0877 | 0.0851 | 0.1076 | 0.1062 | 0.1062 | 0.1198 | 0.0419 |
| Newspaper ${ }^{4}$ | 0.0796 | 0.0948 | 0.0762 | 0.1688 | 0.1075 | 0.1300 | 0.1167 | 0.1060 |
| Child has special lessons ${ }^{4}$ | 0.2393 | 0.1851 | 0.1419 | 0.2222 | 0.1644 | 0.1226 | 0.2437 | 0.1445 |
| Child goes to museums ${ }^{5}$ | 0.1646 | 0.1036 | 0.0230 | 0.1099 | 0.1270 | 0.1303 | 0.1550 | 0.0767 |
| Child goes to theater ${ }^{5}$ | 0.1194 | 0.0370 | 0.0043 | 0.0256 | 0.0440 | 0.0822 | 0.0867 | -0.0004 |
| Education of the mother | 0.3174 | 0.2392 | 0.1943 | 0.1801 | 0.0981 | 0.1227 | 0.2604 | 0.1015 |
| Child ever sees father ${ }^{4}$ | 0.0448 | 0.0406 | 0.0113 | -0.0118 | 0.0173 | 0.0102 | -0.0315 | -0.0200 |
| Child spends time with father indoors ${ }^{6}$ | 0.2060 | 0.1644 | 0.1654 | 0.1406 | 0.1178 | 0.1078 | 0.1967 | 0.0779 |
| Child spends time with father outdoors ${ }^{6}$ | -0.0654 | -0.0363 | -0.0331 | 0.1857 | 0.1817 | 0.1678 | 0.1781 | 0.1419 |
| Child eats with father and mother ${ }^{6}$ | 0.0199 | -0.0297 | -0.0137 | 0.0839 | 0.1036 | 0.1237 | 0.0447 | 0.0003 |
| Child sees relatives and family friends ${ }^{6}$ | -0.0430 | -0.0046 | 0.0158 | 0.1435 | 0.1652 | 0.1234 | 0.0768 | 0.1250 |
| Mother's ASVAB (AR) ${ }^{7}$ | 0.3003 | 0.1929 | 0.1783 | 0.0326 | -0.0350 | 0.0146 | 0.0989 | 0.0011 |
| Mother's ASVAB (WK) ${ }^{8}$ | 0.2923 | 0.2129 | 0.2120 | 0.0395 | 0.0380 | 0.0241 | 0.1451 | -0.0260 |
| Mother's ASVAB (PC) ${ }^{9}$ | 0.3165 | 0.2087 | 0.2383 | 0.0123 | 0.0105 | 0.0149 | 0.1257 | 0.0486 |
| Mother's ASVAB (NO) ${ }^{10}$ | 0.1812 | 0.1281 | 0.1216 | 0.1090 | 0.0437 | 0.0869 | 0.1471 | 0.0621 |
| Mother's ASVAB (CS) ${ }^{11}$ | 0.2288 | 0.1082 | 0.1122 | 0.1752 | 0.0717 | 0.1220 | 0.1776 | 0.1113 |
| Mother's ASVAB (MK) ${ }^{12}$ | 0.3079 | 0.2140 | 0.1727 | 0.0405 | -0.0002 | 0.0447 | 0.1957 | 0.0215 |

${ }^{1}$ The variables are standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire CNLSY/79 sample.
${ }^{2}$ Family Income is inflation adjusted. Base year is 2000.
${ }^{3}$ The variable takes the value 1 if the child has no books, 2 if the child has 1 or 2 books, 3 if the child has 3 to 9 books and 4 if the child has 10 or more books.
${ }^{4}$ For example, for musical instrument, the variable takes value 1 if the child has a musical instrument at home and 0 otherwise. Other variables are defined accordingly.
${ }^{5}$ For example, for "museums", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never went to the museum in the last calendar year, 1 if the child went to the museum once or twice in the last calendar year, 3 if the child went to the museum several times in the past calendar year, 4 if the child went to the museum about once a month in the last calendar year, and 5 if the child went to a museum once a week in the last calendar year.
${ }^{6}$ For example, for "Child spends time with father indoors", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never spends time with the father indoors, 2 if the child spends time with the father indoors a few times in a year, 3 if the child spend time with the father indoors about once a month, 4 if the child spends time with the father indoors about once a week, 5 if the child spends time with the father indoors at least four times a week, and 6 if the child spends time with the father once a day or more often.
${ }^{7}$ AR stands for Arithmetic Reasoning. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{8}$ WK stands for Word Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{9}$ PC stands for Paragraph Composition. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{10}$ NO stands for Numerical Operations. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{11} \mathrm{CS}$ stands for Coding Speed. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{12}$ MK stands for Mathematics Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample

| Web Appendix Table 3 Correlation - White Children NLSY/1979-8 years old |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Math | Reading | Composition | Antisocial | Anxious | Headstrong | Hyperactive | Conflict |
| Piat Math ${ }^{1}$ | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Reading Recognition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5331 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Composition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5594 | 0.8184 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Antisocial Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1263 | 0.1611 | 0.1858 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |
| Anxious Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.0594 | 0.0693 | 0.0714 | 0.4138 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |
| Headstrong Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.0806 | 0.0667 | 0.0798 | 0.5659 | 0.5901 | 1.0000 |  |  |
| Hyperactive Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1839 | 0.1691 | 0.2009 | 0.4865 | 0.4719 | 0.5671 | 1.0000 |  |
| Conflict Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.0675 | 0.0751 | 0.1126 | 0.5341 | 0.3875 | 0.4074 | 0.2934 | 1.0000 |
| Log Current Family Income ${ }^{2}$ | 0.1661 | 0.1783 | 0.2035 | 0.1624 | 0.2024 | 0.1004 | 0.1626 | 0.0956 |
| Number of Books ${ }^{3}$ | 0.1492 | 0.0895 | 0.1000 | 0.1206 | 0.0768 | 0.0872 | 0.1202 | 0.0613 |
| Musical Instrument ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1371 | 0.1844 | 0.2112 | 0.0588 | 0.0580 | 0.0375 | 0.0285 | 0.0787 |
| Newspaper ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1710 | 0.1310 | 0.0966 | 0.1557 | 0.1542 | 0.0715 | 0.1933 | 0.0613 |
| Child has special lessons ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1881 | 0.2080 | 0.2187 | 0.1819 | 0.1709 | 0.1420 | 0.1619 | 0.1704 |
| Child goes to museums ${ }^{5}$ | 0.1712 | 0.1968 | 0.2327 | 0.0547 | 0.0072 | -0.0076 | 0.0399 | 0.0131 |
| Child goes to theater ${ }^{5}$ | 0.1632 | 0.1291 | 0.1337 | 0.0369 | 0.0252 | -0.0340 | 0.0244 | 0.0011 |
| Education of the mother | 0.1983 | 0.1489 | 0.1255 | 0.1559 | 0.1580 | 0.1137 | 0.2014 | 0.0773 |
| Child ever sees father ${ }^{4}$ | -0.0565 | -0.0004 | -0.0090 | -0.0223 | 0.0985 | 0.0145 | 0.0519 | -0.0324 |
| Child spends time with father indoors ${ }^{6}$ | 0.1524 | 0.0964 | 0.1172 | 0.1724 | 0.2445 | 0.1595 | 0.2037 | 0.1615 |
| Child spends time with father outdoors ${ }^{6}$ | 0.0878 | 0.0338 | 0.0715 | 0.1510 | 0.2209 | 0.1442 | 0.1764 | 0.1631 |
| Child eats with father and mother ${ }^{6}$ | 0.0226 | 0.0699 | 0.0691 | 0.0544 | 0.0875 | 0.0432 | 0.0335 | 0.0855 |
| Child sees relatives and family friends ${ }^{6}$ | -0.0040 | 0.0037 | 0.0027 | 0.0747 | 0.0509 | 0.0468 | -0.0062 | 0.0488 |
| Mother's ASVAB (AR) ${ }^{7}$ | 0.3210 | 0.2532 | 0.2335 | 0.1460 | 0.1086 | 0.0849 | 0.1556 | 0.0247 |
| Mother's ASVAB (WK) ${ }^{8}$ | 0.2885 | 0.3076 | 0.2917 | 0.1530 | 0.0724 | -0.0047 | 0.1237 | 0.0430 |
| Mother's ASVAB (PC) ${ }^{9}$ | 0.2806 | 0.2648 | 0.2582 | 0.1377 | 0.0617 | 0.0221 | 0.1121 | 0.0562 |
| Mother's ASVAB (NO) ${ }^{10}$ | 0.2986 | 0.2080 | 0.2191 | 0.1844 | 0.1595 | 0.1360 | 0.2116 | 0.1407 |
| Mother's ASVAB (CS) ${ }^{11}$ | 0.3130 | 0.1908 | 0.1817 | 0.1802 | 0.1482 | 0.1462 | 0.1882 | 0.1271 |
| Mother's ASVAB (MK) ${ }^{12}$ | 0.2770 | 0.2187 | 0.1968 | 0.1479 | 0.1248 | 0.1187 | 0.1550 | 0.0345 |

${ }^{1}$ The variables are standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire CNLSY/79 sample.
${ }^{2}$ Family Income is inflation adjusted. Base year is 2000.
${ }^{3}$ The variable takes the value 1 if the child has no books, 2 if the child has 1 or 2 books, 3 if the child has 3 to 9 books and 4 if the child has 10 or more books.
${ }^{4}$ For example, for musical instrument, the variable takes value 1 if the child has a musical instrument at home and 0 otherwise. Other variables are defined accordingly.
${ }^{5}$ For example, for "museums", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never went to the museum in the last calendar year, 1 if the child went to the museum once or twice in the last calendar year, 3 if the child went to the museum several times in the past calendar year, 4 if the child went to the museum about once a month in the last calendar year, and 5 if the child went to a museum once a week in the last calendar year.
${ }^{6}$ For example, for "Child spends time with father indoors", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never spends time with the father indoors, 2 if the child spends time with the father indoors a few times in a year, 3 if the child spend time with the father indoors about once a month, 4 if the child spends time with the father indoors about once a week, 5 if the child spends time with the father indoors at least four times a week, and 6 if the child spends time with the father once a day or more often.
${ }^{7}$ AR stands for Arithmetic Reasoning. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{8}$ WK stands for Word Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{9}$ PC stands for Paragraph Composition. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{10}$ NO stands for Numerical Operations. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{11}$ CS stands for Coding Speed. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{12} \mathrm{MK}$ stands for Mathematics Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample

| Web Appendix Table 4 Correlation - White Children NLSY/1979-9 years old |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Math | Reading | Composition | Antisocial | Anxious | Headstrong | Hyperactive | Conflict |
| Piat Math ${ }^{1}$ | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Reading Recognition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5509 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Composition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5717 | 0.7617 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Antisocial Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1766 | 0.2741 | 0.2674 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |
| Anxious Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1371 | 0.1545 | 0.1253 | 0.4562 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |
| Headstrong Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1342 | 0.2094 | 0.1759 | 0.5726 | 0.6045 | 1.0000 |  |  |
| Hyperactive Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.2372 | 0.3281 | 0.3356 | 0.5909 | 0.5119 | 0.5723 | 1.0000 |  |
| Conflict Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.0828 | 0.1537 | 0.1207 | 0.5766 | 0.5341 | 0.4151 | 0.4291 | 1.0000 |
| Log Current Family Income ${ }^{2}$ | 0.1248 | 0.1220 | 0.1470 | 0.1299 | 0.1126 | 0.1026 | 0.1194 | 0.1159 |
| Number of Books ${ }^{3}$ | 0.1579 | 0.0988 | 0.1665 | 0.1266 | 0.1358 | 0.0881 | 0.1416 | 0.0933 |
| Musical Instrument ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1254 | 0.1507 | 0.1416 | 0.2009 | 0.1167 | 0.1324 | 0.1431 | 0.1673 |
| Newspaper ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1058 | 0.1828 | 0.1675 | 0.1525 | 0.0514 | 0.0906 | 0.0814 | -0.0248 |
| Child has special lessons ${ }^{4}$ | 0.2916 | 0.2380 | 0.2788 | 0.2408 | 0.2029 | 0.2094 | 0.2453 | 0.1793 |
| Child goes to museums ${ }^{5}$ | 0.1555 | 0.0913 | 0.1489 | 0.1290 | 0.1025 | 0.1960 | 0.1026 | -0.0087 |
| Child goes to theater ${ }^{5}$ | 0.2013 | 0.1752 | 0.1617 | 0.1366 | 0.1345 | 0.1991 | 0.1690 | 0.0341 |
| Education of the mother | 0.3391 | 0.2805 | 0.2777 | 0.2092 | 0.0891 | 0.1379 | 0.1770 | 0.0859 |
| Child ever sees father ${ }^{4}$ | -0.0674 | 0.0311 | 0.0692 | 0.1102 | 0.0960 | 0.1053 | 0.0813 | 0.0067 |
| Child spends time with father indoors ${ }^{6}$ | 0.1352 | 0.1046 | 0.1230 | 0.2529 | 0.2574 | 0.2177 | 0.2276 | 0.1656 |
| Child spends time with father outdoors ${ }^{6}$ | -0.0220 | -0.0246 | 0.0531 | 0.2255 | 0.2713 | 0.2479 | 0.1631 | 0.1621 |
| Child eats with father and mother ${ }^{6}$ | -0.0408 | 0.0174 | 0.0628 | 0.0946 | 0.1670 | 0.0924 | 0.0485 | 0.1380 |
| Child sees relatives and family friends ${ }^{6}$ | 0.0472 | 0.0961 | 0.0926 | 0.0604 | 0.0707 | 0.0437 | 0.0194 | 0.0956 |
| Mother's ASVAB (AR) ${ }^{7}$ | 0.3216 | 0.2575 | 0.2762 | 0.0749 | 0.0064 | 0.0653 | 0.0801 | 0.0149 |
| Mother's ASVAB (WK) ${ }^{8}$ | 0.3001 | 0.2744 | 0.3100 | 0.0567 | 0.0328 | 0.0458 | 0.1522 | 0.0262 |
| Mother's ASVAB (PC) ${ }^{9}$ | 0.2936 | 0.2597 | 0.2793 | 0.0601 | 0.0727 | 0.0733 | 0.1499 | 0.0503 |
| Mother's ASVAB (NO) ${ }^{10}$ | 0.3205 | 0.2603 | 0.2712 | 0.1282 | 0.0704 | 0.1329 | 0.1419 | 0.0773 |
| Mother's ASVAB (CS) ${ }^{11}$ | 0.2447 | 0.2034 | 0.2328 | 0.1803 | 0.0794 | 0.1031 | 0.1336 | 0.1065 |
| Mother's ASVAB (MK) ${ }^{12}$ | 0.3580 | 0.3063 | 0.3171 | 0.1072 | 0.0342 | 0.0789 | 0.1262 | 0.0107 |

${ }^{1}$ The variables are standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire CNLSY/79 sample.
${ }^{2}$ Family Income is inflation adjusted. Base year is 2000.
${ }^{3}$ The variable takes the value 1 if the child has no books, 2 if the child has 1 or 2 books, 3 if the child has 3 to 9 books and 4 if the child has 10 or more books.
${ }^{4}$ For example, for musical instrument, the variable takes value 1 if the child has a musical instrument at home and 0 otherwise. Other variables are defined accordingly.
${ }^{5}$ For example, for "museums", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never went to the museum in the last calendar year, 1 if the child went to the museum once or twice in the last calendar year, 3 if the child went to the museum several times in the past calendar year, 4 if the child went to the museum about once a month in the last calendar year, and 5 if the child went to a museum once a week in the last calendar year.
${ }^{6}$ For example, for "Child spends time with father indoors", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never spends time with the father indoors, 2 if the child spends time with the father indoors a few times in a year, 3 if the child spend time with the father indoors about once a month, 4 if the child spends time with the father indoors about once a week, 5 if the child spends time with the father indoors at least four times a week, and 6 if the child spends time with the father once a day or more often.
${ }^{7}$ AR stands for Arithmetic Reasoning. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{8}$ WK stands for Word Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{9} \mathrm{PC}$ stands for Paragraph Composition. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{10} \mathrm{NO}$ stands for Numerical Operations. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{11} \mathrm{CS}$ stands for Coding Speed. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{12}$ MK stands for Mathematics Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample

|  | Web Appendix Table 5 Correlation - White Children NLSY/1979-10 years old |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Math | Reading | Composition | Antisocial | Anxious | Headstrong | Hyperactive | Conflict |
| $\overline{\text { Piat Math }}{ }^{1}$ | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Reading Recognition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5768 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Composition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5252 | 0.7231 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Antisocial Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1760 | 0.1988 | 0.1677 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |
| Anxious Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1428 | 0.1781 | 0.1189 | 0.5115 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |
| Headstrong Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1218 | 0.1099 | 0.0726 | 0.6013 | 0.6001 | 1.0000 |  |  |
| Hyperactive Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.2547 | 0.3102 | 0.2115 | 0.5514 | 0.5585 | 0.5847 | 1.0000 |  |
| Conflict Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1127 | 0.1099 | 0.0507 | 0.5687 | 0.5577 | 0.4668 | 0.4814 | 1.0000 |
| Log Current Family Income ${ }^{2}$ | 0.1805 | 0.1820 | 0.1549 | 0.1921 | 0.1349 | 0.1288 | 0.1439 | 0.0588 |
| Number of Books ${ }^{3}$ | 0.1811 | 0.2307 | 0.2059 | 0.2514 | 0.1171 | 0.1328 | 0.1738 | 0.0579 |
| Musical Instrument ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1377 | 0.2177 | 0.1126 | 0.1880 | 0.1270 | 0.1133 | 0.1896 | 0.0996 |
| Newspaper ${ }^{4}$ | 0.2391 | 0.1615 | 0.1289 | 0.0603 | 0.0711 | 0.0743 | 0.0550 | 0.0843 |
| Child has special lessons ${ }^{4}$ | 0.2140 | 0.2642 | 0.2013 | 0.1884 | 0.1841 | 0.1520 | 0.1965 | 0.1621 |
| Child goes to museums ${ }^{5}$ | 0.1201 | 0.1197 | 0.1047 | 0.1284 | 0.0517 | 0.1549 | 0.0911 | 0.0418 |
| Child goes to theater ${ }^{5}$ | 0.1945 | 0.1759 | 0.1294 | 0.1306 | 0.0816 | 0.1507 | 0.1530 | 0.0581 |
| Education of the mother | 0.1871 | 0.2202 | 0.1759 | 0.2105 | 0.1798 | 0.1777 | 0.2456 | 0.0950 |
| Child ever sees father ${ }^{4}$ | 0.0519 | 0.0959 | 0.0666 | 0.0041 | -0.0075 | -0.0491 | -0.0021 | -0.0247 |
| Child spends time with father indoors ${ }^{6}$ | 0.1404 | 0.1539 | 0.1367 | 0.1589 | 0.1708 | 0.1681 | 0.1301 | 0.0861 |
| Child spends time with father outdoors ${ }^{6}$ | 0.0638 | 0.0570 | -0.0090 | 0.0815 | 0.2176 | 0.1628 | 0.1226 | 0.0880 |
| Child eats with father and mother ${ }^{6}$ | 0.0065 | 0.0598 | -0.0064 | 0.0285 | 0.1424 | 0.0272 | 0.1151 | 0.0951 |
| Child sees relatives and family friends ${ }^{6}$ | -0.0058 | -0.0018 | -0.0568 | 0.0204 | 0.0355 | -0.0107 | 0.0011 | 0.0192 |
| Mother's ASVAB (AR) ${ }^{7}$ | 0.2822 | 0.3062 | 0.2520 | 0.1316 | 0.1048 | 0.0837 | 0.1337 | 0.0464 |
| Mother's ASVAB (WK) ${ }^{8}$ | 0.2532 | 0.3474 | 0.2901 | 0.1434 | 0.0615 | 0.0426 | 0.1420 | 0.0140 |
| Mother's ASVAB (PC) ${ }^{9}$ | 0.2539 | 0.2866 | 0.2596 | 0.1500 | 0.0967 | 0.0787 | 0.1466 | 0.0708 |
| Mother's ASVAB (NO) ${ }^{10}$ | 0.2937 | 0.2781 | 0.1853 | 0.1947 | 0.1936 | 0.1215 | 0.2003 | 0.0811 |
| Mother's ASVAB (CS) ${ }^{11}$ | 0.2376 | 0.2176 | 0.1566 | 0.1928 | 0.1536 | 0.1164 | 0.1613 | 0.0813 |
| Mother's ASVAB (MK) ${ }^{12}$ | 0.2493 | 0.2978 | 0.2301 | 0.1369 | 0.1320 | 0.1337 | 0.1694 | 0.0311 |

${ }^{1}$ The variables are standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire CNLSY/79 sample.
${ }^{2}$ Family Income is inflation adjusted. Base year is 2000.
${ }^{3}$ The variable takes the value 1 if the child has no books, 2 if the child has 1 or 2 books, 3 if the child has 3 to 9 books and 4 if the child has 10 or more books.
${ }^{4}$ For example, for musical instrument, the variable takes value 1 if the child has a musical instrument at home and 0 otherwise. Other variables are defined accordingly.
${ }^{5}$ For example, for "museums", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never went to the museum in the last calendar year, 1 if the child went to the museum once or twice in the last calendar year, 3 if the child went to the museum several times in the past calendar year, 4 if the child went to the museum about once a month in the last calendar year, and 5 if the child went to a museum once a week in the last calendar year.
${ }^{6}$ For example, for "Child spends time with father indoors", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never spends time with the father indoors, 2 if the child spends time with the father indoors a few times in a year, 3 if the child spend time with the father indoors about once a month, 4 if the child spends time with the father indoors about once a week, 5 if the child spends time with the father indoors at least four times a week, and 6 if the child spends time with the father once a day or more often.
${ }^{7}$ AR stands for Arithmetic Reasoning. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{8} \mathrm{WK}$ stands for Word Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{9} \mathrm{PC}$ stands for Paragraph Composition. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{10}$ NO stands for Numerical Operations. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{11} \mathrm{CS}$ stands for Coding Speed. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{12}$ MK stands for Mathematics Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample

| Web Appendix Table 6 Correlation - White Children NLSY/1979-11 years old |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Math | Reading | Composition | Antisocial | Anxious | Headstrong | Hyperactive | Conflict |
| Piat Math ${ }^{1}$ | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Reading Recognition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5730 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Composition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5274 | 0.7072 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Antisocial Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1584 | 0.2207 | 0.1969 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |
| Anxious Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1198 | 0.1274 | 0.1555 | 0.5024 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |
| Headstrong Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.2100 | 0.1894 | 0.2169 | 0.5840 | 0.6404 | 1.0000 |  |  |
| Hyperactive Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.2625 | 0.3016 | 0.3329 | 0.5533 | 0.5591 | 0.5993 | 1.0000 |  |
| Conflict Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1277 | 0.1532 | 0.2157 | 0.5385 | 0.5331 | 0.4485 | 0.5011 | 1.0000 |
| Log Current Family Income ${ }^{2}$ | 0.2795 | 0.2286 | 0.2020 | 0.2510 | 0.1359 | 0.2184 | 0.2163 | 0.2350 |
| Number of Books ${ }^{3}$ | 0.1866 | 0.1971 | 0.1598 | 0.2279 | 0.1052 | 0.0894 | 0.2199 | 0.1157 |
| Musical Instrument ${ }^{4}$ | 0.2165 | 0.2153 | 0.1784 | 0.2797 | 0.1672 | 0.1592 | 0.1823 | 0.1590 |
| Newspaper ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1100 | 0.2107 | 0.2779 | 0.1427 | 0.0683 | 0.0910 | 0.1620 | 0.0773 |
| Child has special lessons ${ }^{4}$ | 0.2388 | 0.2432 | 0.2366 | 0.3210 | 0.1708 | 0.1574 | 0.3113 | 0.2683 |
| Child goes to museums ${ }^{5}$ | 0.2058 | 0.1491 | 0.1714 | 0.0729 | 0.0630 | 0.0984 | 0.1657 | 0.0575 |
| Child goes to theater ${ }^{5}$ | 0.2006 | 0.1804 | 0.1679 | 0.0613 | 0.0761 | 0.0923 | 0.1403 | 0.0744 |
| Education of the mother | 0.3964 | 0.3368 | 0.3067 | 0.2044 | 0.0383 | 0.1525 | 0.1804 | 0.0965 |
| Child ever sees father ${ }^{4}$ | -0.0466 | 0.0443 | -0.0270 | -0.0668 | -0.0749 | -0.0981 | -0.0618 | -0.0270 |
| Child spends time with father indoors ${ }^{6}$ | 0.1004 | 0.0676 | 0.0899 | 0.2017 | 0.1717 | 0.1387 | 0.1397 | 0.1032 |
| Child spends time with father outdoors ${ }^{6}$ | 0.0193 | -0.0395 | -0.0030 | 0.1820 | 0.2129 | 0.1839 | 0.1746 | 0.1578 |
| Child eats with father and mother ${ }^{6}$ | -0.0712 | -0.0130 | 0.0624 | 0.2238 | 0.2424 | 0.1908 | 0.1474 | 0.1239 |
| Child sees relatives and family friends ${ }^{6}$ | 0.0663 | 0.0540 | 0.1300 | 0.0418 | 0.1619 | 0.0902 | 0.0606 | 0.1284 |
| Mother's ASVAB (AR) ${ }^{7}$ | 0.3469 | 0.2828 | 0.3194 | 0.0664 | -0.0417 | 0.0640 | 0.1206 | 0.0320 |
| Mother's ASVAB (WK) ${ }^{8}$ | 0.3540 | 0.3599 | 0.3298 | 0.1040 | -0.0125 | 0.0518 | 0.1338 | 0.0332 |
| Mother's ASVAB (PC) ${ }^{9}$ | 0.3001 | 0.3330 | 0.3201 | 0.1060 | 0.0179 | 0.0721 | 0.1706 | 0.0953 |
| Mother's ASVAB (NO) ${ }^{10}$ | 0.2862 | 0.2666 | 0.3021 | 0.1271 | 0.0709 | 0.1047 | 0.1493 | 0.0929 |
| Mother's ASVAB (CS) ${ }^{11}$ | 0.2797 | 0.1856 | 0.2854 | 0.1355 | 0.1349 | 0.1635 | 0.2048 | 0.1766 |
| Mother's ASVAB (MK) ${ }^{12}$ | 0.3906 | 0.3095 | 0.3021 | 0.0853 | -0.0331 | 0.0994 | 0.1697 | 0.0723 |

${ }^{1}$ The variables are standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire CNLSY/79 sample.
${ }^{2}$ Family Income is inflation adjusted. Base year is 2000.
${ }^{3}$ The variable takes the value 1 if the child has no books, 2 if the child has 1 or 2 books, 3 if the child has 3 to 9 books and 4 if the child has 10 or more books.
${ }^{4}$ For example, for musical instrument, the variable takes value 1 if the child has a musical instrument at home and 0 otherwise. Other variables are defined accordingly.
${ }^{5}$ For example, for "museums", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never went to the museum in the last calendar year, 1 if the child went to the museum once or twice in the last calendar year, 3 if the child went to the museum several times in the past calendar year, 4 if the child went to the museum about once a month in the last calendar year, and 5 if the child went to a museum once a week in the last calendar year.
${ }^{6}$ For example, for "Child spends time with father indoors", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never spends time with the father indoors, 2 if the child spends time with the father indoors a few times in a year, 3 if the child spend time with the father indoors about once a month, 4 if the child spends time with the father indoors about once a week, 5 if the child spends time with the father indoors at least four times a week, and 6 if the child spends time with the father once a day or more often.
${ }^{7}$ AR stands for Arithmetic Reasoning. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{8}$ WK stands for Word Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{9}$ PC stands for Paragraph Composition. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{10}$ NO stands for Numerical Operations. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{11} \mathrm{CS}$ stands for Coding Speed. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{12}$ MK stands for Mathematics Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample

| Web Appendix Table 7 Correlation - White Children NLSY/1979-12 years old |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Math | Reading | Composition | Antisocial | Anxious | Headstrong | Hyperactive | Conflict |
| Piat Math ${ }^{1}$ | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Reading Recognition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5845 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Composition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5589 | 0.7124 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Antisocial Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.2208 | 0.1676 | 0.1462 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |
| Anxious Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1545 | 0.1038 | 0.0974 | 0.5052 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |
| Headstrong Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.2043 | 0.1425 | 0.1563 | 0.6245 | 0.6237 | 1.0000 |  |  |
| Hyperactive Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.2417 | 0.2079 | 0.2018 | 0.5507 | 0.5327 | 0.6028 | 1.0000 |  |
| Conflict Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1317 | 0.1479 | 0.0406 | 0.5437 | 0.5431 | 0.5096 | 0.4343 | 1.0000 |
| Log Current Family Income ${ }^{2}$ | 0.2333 | 0.2375 | 0.2230 | 0.0985 | 0.2186 | 0.1528 | 0.1198 | 0.0980 |
| Number of Books ${ }^{3}$ | 0.1048 | 0.1381 | 0.1836 | 0.0904 | 0.0104 | 0.0557 | 0.0347 | 0.0869 |
| Musical Instrument ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1811 | 0.1595 | 0.2010 | 0.1080 | 0.0877 | 0.1605 | 0.1317 | 0.0567 |
| Newspaper ${ }^{4}$ | 0.2102 | 0.1950 | 0.1966 | 0.1225 | 0.0768 | 0.1221 | 0.1320 | 0.1370 |
| Child has special lessons ${ }^{4}$ | 0.2138 | 0.1501 | 0.1810 | 0.1552 | 0.1308 | 0.2132 | 0.1650 | 0.1241 |
| Child goes to museums ${ }^{5}$ | 0.1141 | 0.1506 | 0.1493 | 0.1057 | 0.1042 | 0.1044 | 0.0809 | 0.0515 |
| Child goes to theater ${ }^{5}$ | 0.1190 | 0.1562 | 0.1584 | 0.1646 | 0.0955 | 0.1489 | 0.1146 | 0.1202 |
| Education of the mother | 0.2727 | 0.2461 | 0.2987 | 0.1444 | 0.2113 | 0.2074 | 0.2148 | 0.1353 |
| Child ever sees father ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1127 | 0.1259 | 0.0836 | 0.0095 | 0.0477 | 0.0505 | 0.0153 | 0.0468 |
| Child spends time with father indoors ${ }^{6}$ | 0.1222 | 0.0992 | 0.1426 | 0.1223 | 0.1100 | 0.1370 | 0.0939 | 0.0866 |
| Child spends time with father outdoors ${ }^{6}$ | 0.1129 | -0.0056 | -0.0054 | 0.1423 | 0.1893 | 0.1991 | 0.0916 | 0.1503 |
| Child eats with father and mother ${ }^{6}$ | 0.0449 | 0.0525 | 0.0394 | 0.1063 | 0.0982 | 0.1089 | 0.0420 | 0.0416 |
| Child sees relatives and family friends ${ }^{6}$ | 0.0247 | 0.0377 | 0.0152 | -0.0399 | 0.0216 | -0.0717 | -0.0310 | -0.0495 |
| Mother's ASVAB (AR) ${ }^{7}$ | 0.3050 | 0.3451 | 0.4212 | 0.0359 | 0.0764 | 0.0672 | 0.1041 | 0.0131 |
| Mother's ASVAB (WK) ${ }^{8}$ | 0.2341 | 0.3968 | 0.4136 | 0.0101 | 0.0564 | 0.0445 | 0.1191 | 0.0125 |
| Mother's ASVAB (PC) ${ }^{9}$ | 0.2238 | 0.3221 | 0.3427 | 0.0581 | 0.1095 | 0.0590 | 0.1583 | 0.0845 |
| Mother's ASVAB (NO) ${ }^{10}$ | 0.3528 | 0.3356 | 0.3277 | 0.1253 | 0.1540 | 0.1645 | 0.1827 | 0.1268 |
| Mother's ASVAB (CS) ${ }^{11}$ | 0.2685 | 0.2748 | 0.2679 | 0.1164 | 0.1051 | 0.1489 | 0.1818 | 0.1274 |
| Mother's ASVAB (MK) ${ }^{12}$ | 0.3163 | 0.3292 | 0.4155 | 0.0385 | 0.0890 | 0.0827 | 0.0901 | -0.0225 |

[^0]|  | Web Ap | Table 8 | relation - Wh | hildren | 79-13 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Math | Reading | Composition | Antisocial | Anxious | Headstrong | Hyperactive | Conflict |
| Piat Math ${ }^{1}$ | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Reading Recognition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5609 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Piat Composition ${ }^{1}$ | 0.5174 | 0.6983 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Antisocial Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.2014 | 0.2850 | 0.2237 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |  |
| Anxious Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1455 | 0.1406 | 0.1100 | 0.5496 | 1.0000 |  |  |  |
| Headstrong Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.1240 | 0.1843 | 0.0927 | 0.6576 | 0.5809 | 1.0000 |  |  |
| Hyperactive Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.2222 | 0.2987 | 0.2436 | 0.5119 | 0.5230 | 0.5603 | 1.0000 |  |
| Conflict Score ${ }^{1}$ | 0.0490 | 0.1676 | 0.0972 | 0.4706 | 0.5743 | 0.4183 | 0.4352 | 1.0000 |
| Log Current Family Income ${ }^{2}$ | 0.1192 | 0.1321 | 0.1503 | 0.1255 | 0.1192 | 0.1161 | 0.0905 | 0.1170 |
| Number of Books ${ }^{3}$ | 0.1989 | 0.3007 | 0.2962 | 0.2656 | 0.1006 | 0.1398 | 0.1719 | 0.1366 |
| Musical Instrument ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1679 | 0.1946 | 0.2182 | 0.1299 | 0.0976 | 0.0794 | 0.1005 | 0.1042 |
| Newspaper ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1328 | 0.2371 | 0.2227 | 0.1385 | 0.0690 | 0.1404 | 0.1122 | 0.1043 |
| Child has special lessons ${ }^{4}$ | 0.1616 | 0.1277 | 0.1484 | 0.2653 | 0.2164 | 0.2116 | 0.2085 | 0.1582 |
| Child goes to museums ${ }^{5}$ | 0.0189 | 0.1361 | 0.1338 | 0.2278 | 0.1048 | 0.1989 | 0.0968 | 0.1060 |
| Child goes to theater ${ }^{5}$ | 0.0517 | 0.1281 | 0.1000 | 0.1403 | 0.0624 | 0.2043 | 0.0975 | 0.0960 |
| Education of the mother | 0.3412 | 0.3340 | 0.3333 | 0.2207 | 0.0944 | 0.1367 | 0.1458 | 0.1372 |
| Child ever sees father ${ }^{4}$ | -0.0463 | -0.0205 | 0.0625 | 0.0412 | -0.0272 | 0.0242 | -0.0226 | -0.0830 |
| Child spends time with father indoors ${ }^{6}$ | -0.0327 | 0.0621 | 0.0847 | 0.1668 | 0.1021 | 0.1080 | 0.0767 | 0.0412 |
| Child spends time with father outdoors ${ }^{6}$ | -0.0889 | 0.0205 | 0.0181 | 0.1458 | 0.1712 | 0.1780 | 0.1418 | 0.0826 |
| Child eats with father and mother ${ }^{6}$ | 0.0054 | 0.0353 | 0.0272 | 0.0957 | 0.0531 | 0.1135 | 0.0117 | 0.0265 |
| Child sees relatives and family friends ${ }^{6}$ | -0.0514 | 0.0147 | 0.0097 | 0.0641 | 0.0603 | 0.0990 | -0.0019 | 0.0786 |
| Mother's ASVAB (AR) ${ }^{7}$ | 0.3014 | 0.3600 | 0.3306 | 0.0974 | -0.0075 | 0.0359 | 0.1117 | 0.0062 |
| Mother's ASVAB (WK) ${ }^{8}$ | 0.2439 | 0.3923 | 0.3520 | 0.0785 | 0.0059 | 0.0041 | 0.0188 | 0.0863 |
| Mother's ASVAB (PC) ${ }^{9}$ | 0.2573 | 0.3525 | 0.2754 | 0.0646 | -0.0010 | -0.0082 | 0.0562 | 0.0774 |
| Mother's ASVAB (NO) ${ }^{10}$ | 0.2509 | 0.3026 | 0.2368 | 0.1847 | 0.0435 | 0.0792 | 0.1268 | 0.1396 |
| Mother's ASVAB (CS) ${ }^{11}$ | 0.2686 | 0.2988 | 0.2761 | 0.1859 | 0.0538 | 0.1332 | 0.2468 | 0.1636 |
| Mother's ASVAB (MK) ${ }^{12}$ | 0.3238 | 0.3806 | 0.3122 | 0.1397 | 0.0353 | 0.1000 | 0.1433 | 0.0736 |

${ }^{1}$ The variables are standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire CNLSY/79 sample.
${ }^{2}$ Family Income is inflation adjusted. Base year is 2000.
${ }^{3}$ The variable takes the value 1 if the child has no books, 2 if the child has 1 or 2 books, 3 if the child has 3 to 9 books and 4 if the child has 10 or more books.
${ }^{4}$ For example, for musical instrument, the variable takes value 1 if the child has a musical instrument at home and 0 otherwise. Other variables are defined accordingly.
${ }^{5}$ For example, for "museums", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never went to the museum in the last calendar year, 1 if the child went to the museum once or twice in the last calendar year, 3 if the child went to the museum several times in the past calendar year, 4 if the child went to the museum about once a month in the last calendar year, and 5 if the child went to a museum once a week in the last calendar year.
${ }^{6}$ For example, for "Child spends time with father indoors", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never spends time with the father indoors, 2 if the child spends time with the father indoors a few times in a year, 3 if the child spend time with the father indoors about once a month, 4 if the child spends time with the father indoors about once a week, 5 if the child spends time with the father indoors at least four times a week, and 6 if the child spends time with the father once a day or more often.
${ }^{7}$ AR stands for Arithmetic Reasoning. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{8}$ WK stands for Word Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{9}$ PC stands for Paragraph Composition. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{10}$ NO stands for Numerical Operations. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{11}$ CS stands for Coding Speed. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
${ }^{12}$ MK stands for Mathematics Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample

| Web Appendix Table 9 |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| The Technology Equations ${ }^{1}$ |  |  |  |  |
| Robustness Check: Normalize the Factor in Log Family Income |  |  |  |  |
| We use Adult Earnings data to anchor the metric of the factor |  |  |  |  |
| Estimated Parameter Values - Technology from Period 1 to Period 2 |  |  |  |  |
| Next Period Noncognitive Skills |  |  | Next Period | gnitive Skills |
|  | Mean | Standard Error | Mean | Standard Error |
| Current Period Noncognitive Skills | 0.9850 | 0.0135 | 0.0605 | 0.0222 |
| Current Period Cognitive Skills | 0.0513 | 0.0609 | 0.9197 | 0.0821 |
| Current Period Investment | 0.0544 | 0.0110 | 0.1126 | 0.0143 |
| Mother's Education | 0.0029 | 0.0036 | -0.0050 | 0.0050 |
| Mother's Ability | 0.0010 | 0.0991 | 0.0506 | 0.0719 |
| Variance of Shocks | 0.1424 | 0.0158 | 0.0653 | 0.0161 |
| Estimated Parameter Values - Technology from Period 2 to Period 3 |  |  |  |  |
|  | Next Period | cognitive Skills | Next Perio | gnitive Skills |
|  | Mean | Standard Error | Mean | Standard Error |
| Current Period Noncognitive Skills | 0.9384 | 0.0135 | 0.0212 | 0.0079 |
| Current Period Cognitive Skills | -0.0449 | 0.0808 | 0.8844 | 0.0233 |
| Current Period Investment | 0.1062 | 0.0190 | 0.0364 | 0.0146 |
| Mother's Education | -0.0026 | 0.0073 | 0.0131 | 0.0086 |
| Mother's Ability | -0.0078 | 0.0148 | 0.0045 | 0.0067 |
| Variance of Shocks | 0.1284 | 0.0169 | 0.0231 | 0.0065 |
| Estimated Parameter Values - Technology from Period 3 to Period 4 |  |  |  |  |
|  | Next Period Noncognitive Skills |  | Next Perio | gnitive Skills |
|  | Mean | Standard Error | Mean | Standard Error |
| Current Period Noncognitive Skills | 0.7570 | 0.0318 | 0.0014 | 0.0031 |
| Current Period Cognitive Skills | 0.0418 | 0.0277 | 0.9099 | 0.0412 |
| Current Period Investment | 0.0450 | 0.0117 | 0.0380 | 0.0129 |
| Mother's Education | 0.0141 | 0.0122 | 0.0021 | 0.0013 |
| Mother's Ability | -0.0135 | 0.0186 | 0.0194 | 0.0311 |
| Variance of Shocks | 0.1568 | 0.0183 | 0.0104 | 0.0021 |

${ }^{1}$ Let $Y_{t}^{N}=\left(Y_{1, t}^{N}, \ldots, Y_{m_{t}^{N}, t}^{N}\right)^{\prime}$ denote the measurements of noncognitive skills. Let $Y_{t}^{C}=\left(Y_{1, t}^{C}, \ldots, Y_{m_{t}^{C}, t}^{C}\right)^{\prime}$ denote the measurements of cognitive skills. Let $X_{t}=\left(X_{1, t}, \ldots, X_{m_{t}^{I}, t}\right)^{\prime}$ denote the measurements of parental investment (from the HOME-SF score. Let $Y_{t}=\left(Y_{t}^{N}, Y_{t}^{C}, X_{t}\right)$. Let $\theta=\left(\theta_{t}^{N}, \theta_{t}^{C}, I_{t}\right)$ denote the noncognitive, cognitive and investment dynamic factors, respectively. Let $S$ denote mother's education and $A$ denote mother's cognitive ability. The measurement equations are:

$$
Y_{t}=\alpha_{t} \theta_{t}+\varepsilon_{t}
$$

and the technology equations are:

$$
\theta_{t+1}=\gamma_{t} \theta_{t}+\psi_{1, t} S+\psi_{2, t} A+\eta_{t+1}
$$

where $\alpha_{t}$ is the factor-loading matrix, $\gamma_{t}$ is the technology-parameters matrix, $\psi_{k, t}$ are parameter vectors. The vectors $\varepsilon_{t}, \eta_{t+1}$ contain the uniquenesses of the measurement equations and the error terms in the technology equations. In table 5.1 we show the estimated parameter values and standard errors of $\gamma_{t}$, $\psi_{1, t}$, and $\psi_{2, t}$ as well as the $\operatorname{Var}\left(\eta_{t+1}^{N}\right)$ and $\operatorname{Var}\left(\eta_{t+1}^{C}\right)$.

| Web Appendix Table 10 The Technology Equations ${ }^{1}$ |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Robustness Check: We do not use Log Family Income and Normalize the Factor in "Number of We use Earnings data to anchor the metric of the factor Estimated Parameter Values - Technology from Period 1 to Period 2 |  |  |  |  |
|  | Next Period Noncognitive Skills |  | Next Perio | gnitive Skills |
|  | Mean | Standard Error | Mean | Standard Error |
| Current Period Noncognitive Skills | 0.9863 | 0.0123 | 0.0631 | 0.0233 |
| Current Period Cognitive Skills | 0.0524 | 0.0621 | 0.9251 | 0.0908 |
| Current Period Investment | 0.1752 | 0.0342 | 0.4359 | 0.0932 |
| Mother's Education | 0.0033 | 0.0032 | -0.0082 | 0.0069 |
| Mother's Ability | 0.0070 | 0.0932 | 0.0567 | 0.0653 |
| Variance of Shocks | 0.1426 | 0.0159 | 0.0646 | 0.0122 |


| Estimated Parameter Values - Technology from Period 2 to Period 3 |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Next Period Noncognitive Skills | Next Period Cognitive Skills |  |  |
|  | Mean | Standard Error | Mean | Standard Error |
| Current Period Noncognitive Skills | 0.9397 | 0.0210 | 0.0216 | 0.0061 |
| Current Period Cognitive Skills | -0.0438 | 0.0655 | 0.8869 | 0.0421 |
| Current Period Investment | 0.4353 | 0.0612 | 0.1518 | 0.0229 |
| Mother's Education | -0.0031 | 0.0051 | 0.0123 | 0.0068 |
| Mother's Ability | -0.0054 | 0.0129 | 0.0065 | 0.0054 |
| Variance of Shocks | 0.1284 | 0.0154 | 0.0232 | 0.0071 |


| Estimated Parameter Values - Technology from Period $\mathbf{3}$ to Period 4 |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Next Period Noncognitive Skills | Next Period Cognitive Skills |  |  |
|  | Mean | Standard Error | Mean | Standard Error |
|  | 0.7599 | 0.0322 | 0.0019 | 0.0044 |
| Current Period Noncognitive Skills | 0.0521 | 0.0241 | 0.9116 | 0.0499 |
| Current Period Cognitive Skills | 0.0567 | 0.0184 | 0.0507 | 0.0192 |
| Current Period Investment | 0.0083 | 0.0131 | 0.0036 | 0.0021 |
| Mother's Education | -0.0069 | 0.0154 | 0.0193 | 0.0233 |
| Mother's Ability | 0.1574 | 0.0179 | 0.0103 | 0.0020 |
| Variance of Shocks |  |  |  |  |

${ }^{1}$ Let $Y_{t}^{N}=\left(Y_{1, t}^{N}, \ldots, Y_{m_{t}^{N}, t}^{N}\right)^{\prime}$ denote the measurements of noncognitive skills. Let $Y_{t}^{C}=\left(Y_{1, t}^{C}, \ldots, Y_{m_{t}^{C}, t}^{C}\right)^{\prime}$ denote the measurements of cognitive skills. Let $X_{t}=\left(X_{1, t}, \ldots, X_{m_{t}^{I}, t}\right)^{\prime}$ denote the measurements of parental investment (from the HOME-SF score. Let $Y_{t}=\left(Y_{t}^{N}, Y_{t}^{C}, X_{t}\right)$. Let $\theta=\left(\theta_{t}^{N}, \theta_{t}^{C}, I_{t}\right)$ denote the noncognitive, cognitive and investment dynamic factors, respectively. Let $S$ denote mother's education and $A$ denote mother's cognitive ability. The measurement equations are:

$$
Y_{t}=\alpha_{t} \theta_{t}+\varepsilon_{t}
$$

and the technology equations are:

$$
\theta_{t+1}=\gamma_{t} \theta_{t}+\psi_{1, t} S+\psi_{2, t} A+\eta_{t+1}
$$

where $\alpha_{t}$ is the factor-loading matrix, $\gamma_{t}$ is the technology-parameters matrix, $\psi_{k, t}$ are parameter vectors. The vectors $\varepsilon_{t}, \eta_{t+1}$ contain the uniquenesses of the measurement equations and the error terms in the technology equations. In table 5.4 we perform robustness tests for the existence of sensitive periods for cognitive and noncognitive skill developments. In particular, we want to investigate whether the results from table 5.1 are due to the choice of normalization in factor loadings for investment. We show that although the parameter values change, the ordering of the effects is the same as in table 5.1.


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ The variables are standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire CNLSY/79 sample.
    ${ }^{2}$ Family Income is inflation adjusted. Base year is 2000.
    ${ }^{3}$ The variable takes the value 1 if the child has no books, 2 if the child has 1 or 2 books, 3 if the child has 3 to 9 books and 4 if the child has 10 or more books.
    ${ }^{4}$ For example, for musical instrument, the variable takes value 1 if the child has a musical instrument at home and 0 otherwise. Other variables are defined accordingly.
    ${ }^{5}$ For example, for "museums", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never went to the museum in the last calendar year, 1 if the child went to the museum once or twice in the last calendar year, 3 if the child went to the museum several times in the past calendar year, 4 if the child went to the museum about once a month in the last calendar year, and 5 if the child went to a museum once a week in the last calendar year.
    ${ }^{6}$ For example, for "Child spends time with father indoors", the variable takes the value 1 if the child never spends time with the father indoors, 2 if the child spends time with the father indoors a few times in a year, 3 if the child spend time with the father indoors about once a month, 4 if the child spends time with the father indoors about once a week, 5 if the child spends time with the father indoors at least four times a week, and 6 if the child spends time with the father once a day or more often.
    ${ }^{7}$ AR stands for Arithmetic Reasoning. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
    ${ }^{8}$ WK stands for Word Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
    ${ }^{9}$ PC stands for Paragraph Composition. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
    ${ }^{10}$ NO stands for Numerical Operations. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
    ${ }^{11}$ CS stands for Coding Speed. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample
    ${ }^{12}$ MK stands for Mathematics Knowledge. The variable is standardized with mean zero and variance one across the entire NLSY/1979 sample

